



UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA

PRESIDENT'S OFFICE, PLANNING COMMISSION

**NATIONAL POST-MDGs DEVELOPMENT
AGENDA CONSULTATIONS: THE NATIONAL
SYNTHESIS REPORT**

MAY, 2013

The President's Office Planning Commission would like to acknowledge the team of experts, who have tirelessly worked under the leadership of Dr. B. Lunogelo, Executive Director of the Economic and Social Research Foundation (ESRF) in collaboration with Prof. Adolf Mkenda, Head of Department of Economics, University of Dar es Salaam to facilitate several consultations meetings, capturing the discussions by various stakeholders and producing various reports, including this national synthesis report for Post 2015 development agenda.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	III
CONTEXT.....	IV
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 OVERVIEW	1
1.2 GENESIS	1
1.3 MDG 2015 IMPLEMENTATION AND PROGRESS	2
1.4 RATIONALE FOR POST MDG 2015 DEVELOPMENT AGENDA	2
1.5 ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT	3
2.0 THE CONSULTATION PROCESS	4
3.0 THE FUTURE WE WANT: PRIORITY AREAS AND STRATEGIC ACTIONS.....	6
3.1 SUSTAINABLE AND SHARED GROWTH FOR REDUCTION OF INCOME POVERTY	6
3.2 SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION (STIs) AND RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT (R&D).....	11
3.3 CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT.....	14
3.4 QUALITY OF EDUCATION	17
3.5 ACCESS AND QUALITY OF HEALTH CARE SERVICES AND NON-COMMUNICABLE DISEASES.....	21
3.6 MANAGEMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES.....	24
3.7 CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION AND ENERGY	27
3.8 GOOD GOVERNANCE	30
3.9 INEQUALITY AND SOCIAL PROTECTION	34
3.10 GLOBAL ISSUES	38
3.11 VOLUNTEER ACTION AND CIVIC PARTICIPATION	39
4.0 CONCLUSION	42

CONTEXT

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) have become a cornerstone of development policy around the globe since their adoption in 2000 and remains an overarching framework for core development activities of all stakeholders. The ground realities in developing countries such as United Republic of Tanzania where national development priorities are aligned to achieve MDGs are a testament to that claim. United Republic of Tanzania has much to celebrate on the achievement of some MDGs but at the same time it recognizes the challenges ahead in achieving some of the key MDGs particularly reducing poverty and hunger, and maternal mortality.

United Republic of Tanzania took a keen interest in the national consultations on the Post 2015 global development agenda as it provided an opportunity to voice the concerns of people, in particular the poor, the marginalized and the vulnerable groups on a global development agenda that could define their future. The very fact that the MDGs were designed without broader consultations of their main stakeholders, especially at the national level, their generality and loose integration to national policy were also a main attraction to the consultations. Moreover, the Post 2015 consultations in United Republic of Tanzania had two key objectives. First was to contribute to the global discussions on the future framework. Second was to use the information generated from consultations to inform its next series of mid-term development plans and strategies in achieving its long term development aspirations. This report provides a synthesis of views that emerged from the wider national consultations undertaken in United Republic of Tanzania between October 2012 and May 2013.

The consultation process

The process involved three layers of consultations. The first layer involved consultations at the grassroots level in seven zones covering all regions in the Mainland, with vulnerable groups such as women, elderly and youth. The second layer was consultations with a group consisting of the private sector, higher learning and research institutions, and public sector officials. Consultations with government officials, higher learning institutions, non-state actors and vulnerable groups were also held in Unguja and Pemba-the two main isles in Zanzibar. In addition, parallel consultations were also held by youth groups, in particular the United Nations Association and the Youth United Nations Association, and civil society organizations. Further, United Republic of Tanzania co-hosted the regional thematic consultations on energy. The final layer of consultations was at the national level for validation, prioritization and approval of the findings.

Outcome of consultations

The broad message coming out of the consultations is that the MDGs are still relevant as there is an unfinished business, but there is a need to go beyond MDGs to take into account new and emerging issues and aspirations. The messages arising from the consultations are classified into

following ten key goals and targets that could be considered for the Post 2015 Development Agenda.

Key Goals for Post 2015 Agenda

- (i) Eradicate extreme poverty, hunger and inequality
- (ii) Achieve decent and productive employment
- (iii) Ensure quality service delivery
- (iv) Eliminate Gender inequality
- (v) Combat diseases
- (vi) Reduce child and maternal mortality
- (vii) Promote Sustainable development
- (viii) Improve governance
- (ix) Enhancing effective development cooperation
- (x) Promoting peace and security

1. **Eradicate extreme poverty, hunger and inequality** with possible targets being linked to (a) reduce poverty (b) reduce hunger (c) ensuring food security and nutrition and (d) reduce income inequality. The severity in impact on overall human development progress makes this goal as relevant as in the MDGs. But this goes beyond the MDGs with a focus on advancing income equality which has not been considered in the MDGs. Key to achieving this is for promoting inclusive growth that benefits all rather than a selected group of the population.

2. **Achieve decent and productive employment** with possible targets being linked to (a) overall employment, (b) youth employment, (c) women's participation in the labour market and (d) women's share in total employment. While some issues such as achieving decent and productive employment has been a part and parcel of MDGs, much attention was not paid to this target. Unemployment, in particular youth unemployment, has gained momentum in recent years and has been a major concern particularly of youth in United Republic of Tanzania. The consultations also emphasized the importance of creating decent employment. The more educated group's demand was for growth with structural transformation that generates employment. The issue of applying science, technology, innovation and research and development to transform the economy to a competitive one through productivity improvement came up in a number of different ways during the consultations.

3. **Ensure quality service delivery** with possible targets being linked to (a) health, (b) education, (d) water and (d) sanitation. A strong voice is heard during the consultations on the

need to focus more on the quality rather than the quantity, especially with regard to health and education. While United Republic of Tanzania is most likely to achieve education goal (MDG 2), quality of education has been a great concern for all and reflected in the national consultations at all levels. Lack of skills and access to quality education were considered a pressing issue by the youth and civil society organizations. Similar concerns relate to health, water and sanitation as well. Access to quality health services is considered vital for reducing maternal and child mortality and in reducing poverty. It is in this light that the need to go for the next step of ensuring increased access to quality basic services in the Post 2015 agenda is felt strongly in the United Republic of Tanzanian consultations.

4. **Eliminate Gender inequality** with possible targets being linked to (a) equality in education, (b) employment, (c) gender based violence, (d) female genital mutilation and (e) assets ownership. The issue of gender inequality came very strongly, especially from the civil society organizations and women's groups. The discussions went beyond eliminating gender gaps in education and employment to consider gender based violence, patriarchal cultures over assets ownership and customs such as female genital mutilation all of which tend to hinder women's progress in human development.

5. **Combat diseases** with possible targets being linked to (a) malaria, (b) HIV/AIDS, (c) Tuberculosis (TB), and (d) non-communicable diseases (NCDs). United Republic of Tanzania has made considerable progress in combating diseases such as TB, Malaria and HIV/AIDS. Although United Republic of Tanzania has reversed the spread of HIV/AIDS recently, and made significant progress in reducing TB and malaria, the threat of diseases to vulnerable groups, in particular infants and some regions, is a concern. On the other hand, non-communicable diseases are considered an emerging issue that needs greater attention.

6. **Reduce child and maternal mortality** with possible targets being linked to (a) Infant mortality, (b) child mortality, and (c) maternal mortality. Child and maternal mortality was considered a hindrance to development and poverty alleviation by civil society organizations. While progress has been made in infant and child mortality, maternal mortality is a serious concern as the rate is still very high although United Republic of Tanzania made gains reducing maternal mortality in recent years.

7 **Promote sustainable development** with possible targets being linked to (a) environmental management-in particular ensuring undertaking environmental impact assessments (EIAs) on projects, (b) natural resource management (c) population growth, (d) sustainable energy use and (e) adaptation to climate change effects. Environmental issues have not been seriously taken into consideration in the MDGs but climate change and sustainable development are emerging as serious concerns since. In particular the threat of sea level rise is considered a serious issue to sustainable development. In this regard, the need to promote

measures for reducing climate change effects and for adaptation to climate change was considered vital. While environmental degradation was a concern of the youth, sustainable development featured well in the dialogue with civil society organizations and higher learning institutions and other groups. The need for the effective management of natural resources was a particular concern of most consultative groups. Universal access and sustainable use of energy were considered key priorities by participants at the thematic consultations on energy.

8. **Improve governance** with possible targets being linked to (a) Rule of law and law enforcement, (b) anti-corruption, (c) freedom of expression, (d) participation and inclusiveness, (e) social protection. Good governance, an area missed in the MDGs, was considered by all consultative groups as a key concern for sustainable development. In this regard, capacity building in these areas at national and local levels is considered vital.

9. **Enhancing effective development cooperation** with possible targets being linked to (a) commitment and timely delivery of aid (b) development/implementation effectiveness in ensuring effectiveness of development aid and (c) transparency and accountability. Consultations also emphasized the need for aid to be pertinent and meet recipient priorities. All stressed the need to have a strategy to reduce aid dependency and make more effective use of domestic resources for development.

10. **Promoting peace and security** with possible targets being linked to (a) promoting democracy, (b) political accountability, justice and fairness. Most consultative groups, particularly the more educated groups, considered peace and security as pre-requisites for economic development and attaining the future that all Tanzanians aspire for. Good governance, both at national and global level, is considered fundamental in this regard.

The need to avoid one size fits all approach, perhaps with separate targets at global, regional and national level could also be considered for greater effectiveness of the agenda.

Key messages arising from consultations with different stakeholder groups			
Consultations at the Local/zonal level and CSOs	Consultations at Higher Learning and research institutions, private sector and government officials	Consultations in Zanzibar	Consultations with youth groups
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Poverty and Inequality</i> • <i>Employment Opportunities for youth and other groups</i> • <i>Quality of education and learning environment</i> • <i>Access to quality Health Services</i> • <i>Food security</i> • <i>Good Governance and Accountability</i> • <i>Effects of climate change especially on the poor</i> • <i>Aid effectiveness</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Production and Economic Transformation: Emphasis on employment-generating growth</i> • <i>Quality of Public Services</i> • <i>Management of Natural Resources</i> • <i>Social Protection and Social Security</i> • <i>Peace and Security, Human Rights and Good Governance</i> • <i>Improving implementation Effectiveness</i> • <i>Institutional capacities, mindset change and good governance</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Private Sector Growth & Participation • Poverty Reduction through quality growth • Mobilise Domestic Resources • Changing of mindset towards employment • Sustainable Development, including land use planning and management • Reducing Environmental degradation and mitigating the effects of climate change • Enhance Democratic Good Governance • Quality Social Services • Improved Government Communication • Capacity Development • Peace and Security 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poverty • Rapid population growth and a youthful population. • High levels of illiteracy • Inadequate levels of education- • going beyond primary completion • Unemployment, especially youth unemployment • Weak leadership and Mismanagement of resources • Social injustice • in particular impunity around rights violations against girls and albinos • Environmental degradation • Limited access to information at local level in accessible formats

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview

The challenges of human development, especially in developing countries, have revolved around low growth, poverty and inequities. A number of global efforts have been directed towards reversing these trends, especially after 1990 when the Human Development Report was published by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). The report triggered a number of global summits and conferences each addressing a specific human development theme. At the level of nations, domestic policies, programmes and strategies were designed and implemented, aimed at improving human development through attaining high growth rates of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and reduction of poverty.

This report is a synthesis of the views of the people expressed during the consultations with regard to the post 2015 global development agenda of a shared global vision on the “*Future We Want*”. The report presents the contribution of the United Republic of Tanzania to the development of the post 2015 development agenda when the current set of MDGs comes to an end. The report is a result of deep and wide consultations that were inclusive and participatory. While serving this main purpose, the report also delineates issues raised during the consultations that are specific to Tanzania, and informs the future development agenda of the nation.

After presenting an overview, genesis, MDG 2015 implementation and progress, as well as rationale and the outline of the report, the contents of the report are presented along ten priority areas before concluding in chapter four. The report also showcases both processes and content that may inform other nations.

1.2 Genesis

At the United Nations (UN) Millennium Summit held in September 2000 and attended by 147 Heads of State and Governments, who together as a group represented 189 member nations of the UN, commitments on human development, made at previous conferences and summits were renewed. These ranged from the World Conference on Education for All (EFA) by 2000, through the World Summit for Social Development in March 1995, to the UN Conference on the 20/20 Initiative (on funding basic social services) in 1998. These commitments were consolidated into the Millennium Declarations, one of which constituted the eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which in turn were updated at the half way mark by a few additions, such as MDG5B. It was held that full achievement of the MDGs by 2015, would greatly improve human development.

At the global level, progress in MDGs has shown mixed results. While the Asian continent has recorded good progress, the African continent, especially Sub Saharan Africa, is likely to miss most of the goals. Two major initiatives for moving the MDGs notion from advocacy to

implementation were made. The first was the “Gleneagles scenario” in 2010, which sought to mobilize additional resources for bridging the financial gap and scaling up interventions. The second was the MDG Acceleration Framework (MAF) in 2011 which identified scaling-up opportunities, targeting specific MDGs that are most likely to be missed.

1.3 MDG 2015 Implementation and Progress

Since time of political independence in 1961, Tanzania has had a good track record in implementing policies and programmes for promoting human development. Currently, Tanzania’s development framework is guided by Development Vision 2020 (Zanzibar) and Tanzania Development Vision 2025 (Mainland Tanzania). Both aspire for a middle income country status and eradication of abject poverty. Key policy frameworks notably National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP/*MKUKUTA*) and Tanzania Five Year Development Plan (TFYDP) for the Mainland; and *MKUZA* for Zanzibar, mainstreamed MDGs for improving performance and monitoring of progress. Tanzania is party to the Millennium Declaration and has consistently shown great commitment to achieving the MDGs, manifested in being the first country in the world to produce MDG Country report in 2001.

Despite her serious commitment to implementing the MDGs, Tanzania’s progress has varied across the goals and localities. The Tanzania MDGs Progress Report 2011 shows that the country is likely to achieve only two MDGs – MDG 2, universal primary education and MDG 6 “halt and begin to reverse the spread of HIV&AIDS, malaria and other major diseases. If the pace of development is expedited, it can most likely achieve on gender equity and women empowerment (MDG3); reducing child mortality (MDG4) and developing global partnerships for development (MDG8). Two important MDGs will not be met, namely: eradication of extreme poverty and hunger (MDG1) and improvement of maternal mortality (MDG5). Despite this reality, Tanzania can still make interventions within the remaining period in order to achieve “better scores” for the problematic MDGs by 2015.

1.4 Rationale for Post MDG 2015 Development Agenda

The terminal year for the current set of Millennium Development Goals is 2015. The world in general, and Tanzania in particular, faces three options: discard the current set completely in favour of a new set; continue with the current MDGs set, or modify the current MDGs set (MDG+). The option of discarding the current set is not feasible given that the present set has addressed the important dimensions of human development. Continuing with the current set in its present form does not seem feasible either, in light of the lessons learned during their implementation, especially the challenges of growth, quality and equity and the varied geometry in their progress.

A new framework, which combines the current set with modifications together with new aspirations, will have to be operational after 2015, which, of necessity, will be informed by

implementation of the current set of MDGs. The post 2015 development agenda has to garner “views of the people” and articulate the new inspirations while also ensuring a bottom-up approach to defining and shaping it.

1.5 Organization of the Report

This report is organized along four chapters. The first chapter has provided background to the report. Chapter two is devoted to documenting the consultation process. It is followed by chapter three on major findings and emerging issues (The Future we want: Priority areas and strategic actions) and actions and measures to be taken (what should be done, by who and how, in order to achieve the objectives and goals). The last chapter is devoted to conclusions.

2.0 THE CONSULTATION PROCESS

The Post-MDGs Consultation process in Tanzania was inclusive and participatory. During this process the website for the national consultative process (www.ncp2015.go.tz) was also launched. The website was meant to disseminate information and create awareness regarding the consultation process including; the background, objectives and expected outcome of the process, status and information about Millennium Development Goals, photos, documents.

The process involved eight components, namely: Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Local Government Authorities (LGAs), Vulnerable Groups (the elderly, women, children, young women and youth), Private Sector, Officials from the Central Government and representatives from Higher Education (Learning) and Research Institutions (the HERIs) as well as Volunteer Involving Organisations (VIOs). The eighth component was for Zanzibar. Out of the eight components, four Post MDG Consultation reports were produced. The first one for CSOs, LGAs and Vulnerable Groups. The second report was for Private Sector, Officials from the Central Government and Representatives from Higher Education (Learning) and Research Institutions, the third report for Zanzibar consultations while the fourth report for the VOs. The vulnerable groups report was particularly meant to include the marginalized and voiceless poor. This is the group which had limited opportunity to participate during the formulation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs 2015).

The President's Office's Planning Commission (POPC) commissioned the University of Dar es Salaam to consult with the government executives, private sector representatives and representatives of higher education and research institutions. POPC commissioned ESRF to consult with CSOs and LGAs in seven zones¹. LGAs representatives were selected from all four levels of local government in each region namely Regional Secretariat, District Council, Ward level and Village level. On the other hand, CSOs representatives were selected based on the number of CSOs in Mainland Tanzania. Out of the total number of CSOs in the Mainland, two CSOs were selected randomly from each region where one CSO executive and one beneficiary were selected. While the representatives of CSOs, LGAs, and vulnerable groups were drawn from each of the seven zones in Mainland Tanzania. For Zanzibar, the Central Government, Local Government Authorities (LGAs), other governmental organizations, Universities and Research Institutions were consulted as well as the CSOs and their beneficiaries and the Private Sector. These consultations were conducted both in Unguja and Pemba islands. Furthermore, UNDP/UNV facilitated consultations with seventeen (17) Volunteer Involving Organizations (national and international) together with the Youth Department, Ministry of Information, Youth, Culture and Sports. Finally, the thematic consultation on energy took place for a day that included experts, Youth, businesses, CSOs

¹The seven zones are the Lake Zone (LZ) which drew participants from four regions, namely; Kagera, Mara, Mwanza and Geita; the Northern Zone (NZ) which drew participants from three regions, namely; Arusha, Kilimanjaro and Tanga; the Central Zone (CZ) which drew participants from three regions, namely; Manyara, Dodoma and Singida; the Southern Highlands Zone (SHZ) with participants from five regions, namely; Ruvuma, Rukwa, Mbeya, Njombe and Katavi; the Southern Zone (SZ) with participants from two regions, namely; Lindi and Mtwara; the Western Zone (WZ) with participants from three regions, namely; Kigoma, Simiyu, Shinyanga and Tabora; and the Eastern Zone (EZ) drew participants from three regions, namely; Morogoro, Coast and Iringa.

and government officials. Youth of United Nations Association (YUNA) organized their consultations in Dodoma. Details of these consultative processes are found in separate reports.

Various tools were deployed for the Post-MDGs consultations and collection of views and perceptions from the stakeholders. Most of the consultations were organized through workshops where stakeholders were invited and their views were collected through plenary, Focus Group Discussions and individual interviews. This was the case particularly with CSOs, youth groups, LGAs, Government executives, private sector, and the Higher Education and Research Institutions (HERIs) both on the Mainland and in Zanzibar. During these workshops the media were invited to participate fully in informing, sensitizing and disseminating the workshop deliberations. All the consultation workshops were officially launched by the respective Regional Commissioners or acting Regional Commissioners (in the Mainland) and invited top government executives in Zanzibar.

In addition to workshops, different communication channels were deployed to inform the targeted society about the process, sensitize the society to participate and contribute their views, ideas, perceptions and experiences, and disseminate their voices to a wider audience. The channels used were mainly print ‘*Newspapers*’ electronic media ‘*Radio and Televisions*’, websites, blog and social media facilities (Twitter and Face book) and Press Conference. The Tanzania Knowledge Network (TAKNET) attracted a lot of contributions from Tanzanians within and outside the country. Apart from national media houses, local and community media were encouraged to cover the specific events since the workshops involved participants from sub-national level (LGAs and CSO) and the intention was to reach the people at grassroots level.

Social Media for national consultative process as well as those specifically targeting LGAs and CSOs were developed. The social media developed for national process were: **Blog** (<http://www.ncp2015.go.tz/blog/>), **Face book** (<http://www.facebook.com/Post2015DA>), **twitter** (<https://twitter.com/Post2015DA>) and **you tube** (<https://www.youtube.com/post2015DA>). ESRF developed a special web page (<http://www.esrf.or.tz/post2015MDG.php>) to facilitate consultations among the LGAs and CSOs. The website was meant to disseminate information and create awareness regarding the consultation process including; the background, objectives and expected outcome of the process, status and information about Millennium Development Goals, photo, documents (i.e. presentation and report).

Equally important was the need to document the process and findings for references now and in the future. Video and still pictures were also taken during the consultation process, which covered participation and involvement of participants in the whole process. One documentary was also prepared to cover consultations workshops’ deliberations.

3.0 THE FUTURE WE WANT: PRIORITY AREAS AND STRATEGIC ACTIONS

3.1 Sustainable and Shared Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty

(a) Introduction

One of the important objectives of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) was to promote shared global development, with the underlying desire to reduce extreme poverty. At the national level in Tanzania, the MDGs were incorporated in the national development frameworks, namely MKUKUTA/MKUZA (I and II), and the Five-Year Development Plan (FYDP- 2011/11- 2015/16). These frameworks more fundamentally embodied the aspirations of the Tanzania Development Vision (TDV-2025) and Zanzibar Vision 2020, with respect to development, which inter *alia* set the target of economic growth rate of at least 8 percent per annum. Such growth rate was considered good enough to render sufficient impact on reducing poverty and propel Tanzania to graduate “from a least developed country to a middle income country with a high level of human development”.

The FYDP has unpacked this target more succinctly by specifying five core priorities to be targeted to unleash Tanzania’s latent growth potentials. These include: (i) Infrastructures (e.g. large investments in energy, transport infrastructure , water and sanitation and ICT); (ii) Agriculture, focusing more on the transformation of agriculture to food self-sufficiency and enhanced exports, irrigation and high value crops; (iii) Industrial development particularly adding value to local raw materials, as well as development of special economic zones, which would also facilitate public-private partnerships (PPPs); (iv) Human capital development that enhances skills with emphasis on science, technology and innovation; and lastly (v) promoting tourism, trade and financial services.

(b) Findings

An evaluation of the TDV 2025 made in 2009/10 concluded that there has been relatively high economic growth and significant improvement in the management of the macro-economy over the past two decades. However, the growth rate has remained below the trajectory set in the National Development Visions. Furthermore, growth is not trickling down as desired, i.e. has essentially not been pro-poor. The proportion of population living below the basic needs poverty line declined from 38.6 percent from 1992 to 33.6 percent in 2007. In Zanzibar basic poverty was reduced from 61 percent in 1992 to 44.4 percent in 2010. On the other hand, the proportion of population in the Mainland living below the food poverty line declined from 22 percent in 1990 to 16.6 percent in 2007. In Zanzibar, proportion of the food poor declined from 25 percent in 1992 to 13 percent in 2010. The insignificant decline in food poverty was partly due to increases in cost of food items globally, a phenomenon observed towards the end of the 2000s. High population growth partly contributed to making the rapid economic growth result only in marginal reduction of poverty rates.

Specific findings:

(i) Agricultural Growth

Agriculture in Tanzania is the backbone of the economy. This was reasserted by many stakeholders in the regions who frequently referred to this sector directly or indirectly in analyzing the MDG goals that affect their daily lives. Yet, agriculture which engages the majority of the people in Tanzania has been lagging behind many other sectors. In the last few years, agriculture grew only by around 4.5 percent per annum, lower than the economic growth of close to 7% on average per annum. This situation has been blamed on poor or lack of reliable commodity markets, poor state of infrastructure especially rural roads, low tech agricultural equipments, and limited capital investment. Lagging agricultural growth explains the increased marginalisation and vulnerabilities, with for example, stark poverty disparities between rural and urban areas.

(ii) Unemployment

Quality growth is achieved when the growth process is inclusive and benefits equitably shared. One of the quality indicators is generation of decent employment. In this context, the menace of unemployment in Tanzania is a recurring problem cited by almost all the groups in the consultative process. In some quarters, youth unemployment has been regarded as “time bomb”. A major concern is that formal employment sector cannot sustain the growing population of job seekers. Young people also are not prepared for self employment. In this regard, the agricultural sector which is the largest employer in the economy has to be improved, although ultimately the industrialization process (especially SMEs) that generates sufficient linkages with the agricultural sector will guarantee poverty reducing-employment generation. In addition, young people are being driven to move to urban areas due to the differences in livelihood sources between rural and urban areas and in turn scramble for the limited employment opportunities in towns. Of concern is the rapid growth of poor populations and subsequent environmental degradation in cities due to rural urban migration as noted in the large numbers of urban populations living in slums, most of which are in neglected areas in terms of access to social services. It is obviously because of this that many participants stressed the importance of economic growth that goes hand in hand with economic transformation. In a poignant assertion on unemployment, some respondents of the Post-2015 MDG process reported that there was insufficient systematic focus by government on making growth inclusive and job creating. In other words, the efforts towards equitable economic growth have not been satisfactory. Post 2015 development agenda should address and monitor issues of employment and to effectively do that, labour market statistics will have to be strengthened.

(iii) Relying on Natural Resources

Observations were made that Tanzania’s economy is over-exploiting natural resources to achieve its growth. This is compromising the interests of future generations. More effective management of the resources is imperative. The discovery of natural gas and uranium reserve

is a cause of excitement but it has to be handled responsibly. Avoiding resource curse is a challenge that Tanzania will have to address if it has to develop sustainably.

(iv) Private Sector Involvement

The Private Sector has a special role to play in reducing poverty and ensuring sustainable development. In Tanzania Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) are increasingly looked upon as an instrument for achieving this end. Government formulated PPP Act in 2010 in order to facilitate this process further and support KILIMO KWANZA and SAGCOT² initiative, a location-based multi-sector investment programme. In this new stance, it should not be forgotten that the smallholders are a private sector par *excellence*.

(v) Climate Change

Many areas have been left to the mercy of climate whims, and thus causing undesirable fluctuations in the pattern of growth. For instance, due to drought women suffered most particularly in the supply of water, since they are forced to walk long distances to fetch water instead of doing other productive activities. On the Zanzibar side, due to its location, Zanzibar is particularly vulnerable to climate change and as a small island; Zanzibar's special vulnerability might be obscured. The hostile cyclones such as el-Niño are likely to affect a small island like Zanzibar more than a big country.

(c) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

The following are the priorities with respect to achieving higher and sustained economic growth.

(i) Promote inclusiveness to achieve faster poverty reduction

All groups recommended strong measures to be taken to encourage inclusive growth and wrestle poverty. It was emphasized that interventions have to be specific, targeting both productive and social sectors of the economy. The need to continue improving the capacity of people (human development needs) to manage the enabling environment for business and improve governance was particularly emphasized. Disenchantment was particularly high on tendency of land grabbing as it disposed peasants of a key livelihood source. The role of resource mobilization was stressed as key in facilitating growth, with particular emphasis on domestic resources (and appropriate assistance from external sources).

(ii) Employment Opportunities for youth and other groups

It was asserted that unemployment in a growing economy is largely caused by: weak governance and accountability, insecurity, lack of good policies and legislations or their enforcement; people not participating in setting development goals and priorities, and not least youth being less prepared to face life challenges and demands, or simply not willing to work hard. The latter can be tackled through effective transformation of the mindset and

² SAGCOT is Southern Agriculture Growth Corridor of Tanzania

cultural change in favour of promoting attitudes of self-development, social values, and the spirit of self-reliance, among others. When unemployment is due to structural changes taking place in the economy, then that becomes government responsibility to deal with, through the policy and planning platforms.

(iii) Agriculture

There is need to address food insecurity more forcefully – it is linked with weather variability in the context of climate change, inadequate rural investment particularly in irrigation infrastructure, poor access to markets and agricultural credit and inputs. Foremost is to support timely provision of agriculture equipment, fertilizers and seeds. On the other hand, the fate of this sector is interwoven with other cross-cutting issues, especially: environmental degradation and Climate Change; dependence on rain-fed agriculture; poor access to loans, incentives/subsidies to small farmers; as well as poor physical infrastructure especially rural roads.

(iv) Private sector

The private sector is essential for the growth of the economy and reduction in income poverty but requires effective regulation to prevent harmful practices. Participation of the private sector in productive and other activities is imperative to accelerate sustained growth and inclusive development. In order to realize these, further improvement is necessary on the conducive environment to inspire investors' confidence, through transparent, effective and efficient administrative government institutions, as well as Public Private Partnerships (PPPs), coupled with appropriate legal and regulatory frameworks.

(v) Rapid Population Growth

Tanzanian population is predominantly rural and youthful with approximately 73% being below 30 years. Given the high population growth rates (2.7%); the high and stagnating total fertility rates (5.4%), (varying from 6-8 children among poor women), and low contraceptive prevalence rates (27% among married women) and high unmet need for contraception 25% , Tanzania's population will continue to grow for some time and will remain young. The existence of a young population base reflects the existence of a demographic window of opportunity, and in view of this, the right social and economic investments today will ensure that the demographic window of opportunity becomes a demographic bonus. Currently, the population is set to double in 26 years. This is placing a significant demand on the country's services and resources. A large number of youths currently unemployed have shown signs of leading to major social conflict. Addressing this challenge is imperative and should be tackled within deliberate measures to manage the rate of population growth in a responsible manner, coupled with creating decent employment opportunities..

In view of the above, the following priority actions were proposed:

- **Accelerated Growth:** the rate of economic growth has not been fast enough to reach the 8 percent target envisaged in TDV 2025 and Zanzibar Vision 2020 and neither has the growth contributed to fast reduction of poverty levels. The launching

of the Big Results Now (BRN)³ approach recently promises to rekindle government efforts in delivering rapid progress, which also needs to take into account the influence of the changing population dynamics that include fertility, migration; and population growth and distribution. These need keen follow up by development partners for support.

- **Agriculture:** There is need to increase modernization and commercialization of agriculture and link it with agro-industry for enhancement of the value chain. Complementary initiatives should include availability of financial resources to investors as well as scaling up of capacity building of key players in the sector – especially women - by investing in the human capabilities of the poor such as in women’s ability to realize their productive potential. Remedial measures, including supporting rural investments, particularly irrigation infrastructure, are of great importance since small farmers may not be well placed to capitalize on emerging opportunities. Also all measures which raise agricultural productivity (and production) should be supported. Beyond farm production measures, there will be need to address the outlet issues, e.g. in enhancing access to markets through strong cooperatives; issues of access to agricultural credit and reducing agricultural waste. A fast growing and modern agricultural sector will generate more employment for the rural youth.
- **Employment:** Citizens’ call for equitable generation of employment opportunities was called, especially for the southern part of the country. In other proposals, mention was made on the need to review the education curricular to include vocational training from the basic level (primary schools) and as a way of imparting entrepreneurship skills among the youth to facilitate self-employment. In addition, the education system should examine the relevance of skills offered by institutions in the country in order to meet the needs of the market.
- **Management of Fiscal Sector:** In order to boost growth, it was recommended to improve revenue management and widen the scope of revenue sources for increased revenue collection, at the same time ensure equity in sharing the public resources and install austerity measures to control public expenditure. For local governments, there is a need to increase people’s participation at the grassroots level in determining development priorities, and increase efficiency in supervising the implementation of public policies in key sectors of the economy.
- **Citizens’ initiatives:** It is vital to organize support for cooperative endeavours emerging in different forms like Community-Based Organizations (CBO) and different development groups like VICOPA.

³ This is copied from the Malaysian PEMANDU model that tightly monitors government ministries’ performance from the President’s Office

- **Private sector:** One way of supporting the private sector is through investment in hydroelectric power and other sources of energy. Further, reforms that are critical for sound private sector development will continue more rigorously. In addition, efforts have to continue in the long run in the following areas: improving the physical infrastructure, access to finance, macroeconomic stability, legal and institutional framework, taxation, skills development, education and labour market efficiency.

3.2 Science, Technology, Innovation (STIs) and Research and Development (R&D)

(a) Findings

In all consultations issues related to science, technology, innovation (STIs) and Research and Development (R&D) were pointed out as being critical and priority issues that need to be integrated in the Post-MDG development agenda for Tanzania.

(i) *Low Application of Science, Technology and Innovation (STIs)*

National social and economic development is largely dependent on effective application of knowledge in productive and associated activities. This means that growth and sustainability of the national economy depends on application of STIs, without which any nation stands to miss development opportunities and experience social and economic stagnation. To this end purposeful effort has to be taken to make efficient use of scientific information, technologies and innovations which are generated by well designed research endeavours that respond to the needs and demands of different socio-economic sectors of the country.

(ii) *Poor state of Infrastructure and Telecommunication*

Among the priority issues that emerged from the Post MDGs consultations that have positive effect on livelihoods improvement of infrastructure and telecommunications, particularly mobile telephone services and improvement of science and technology were pointed out. However, accessibility to telecommunication services, particularly internet services needs to be expanded in order to benefit the wider population.

(iii) *Inadequate Innovation and Research Funding*

The Post-MDGs consultations acknowledged that Tanzania is making a significant forward leap towards adoption of STIs, R&D in running the country's development programmes and projects and the economy as a whole. However, shortage of financial resources is one of the critical factors undermining the adoption of STIs, R&D systems in Tanzania. In most STIs, R&D-related institutions there are a huge gap between resource requirements and available resources. In addition, the small budgets which are availed to the STIs, R&D institutions have not been allocated strategically and utilization is occasionally sub-optimal.

(iv) Inadequate critical mass of professionals

Closely linked to application of STIs is a critical mass of personnel with science background. Tanzania thus needs to produce qualified personnel, who can be engaged in professional works that require science background.

(b) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

As pointed out earlier, science, technology, innovation (STI) and Research and Development (R&D) are critical for the country's transformation. Investing in the sciences and technological advancement coupled with managerial capabilities were viewed as the foundation for sustainable development in the country. It was remarked that sustainable growth is attained, particularly in view of the exploitation of non-renewable natural resources such as natural gas, uranium, gold and other minerals by adapting and deploying environmentally friendly technologies.

In addition, the growth that Tanzania seeks to achieve to become a middle income economy must be based on a transformed economy. To this end enhancing productivity in the agricultural sector (which will also ensure food security) is necessary. This goes hand in hand with science, technology and innovation (the use of modern agricultural technologies). Tanzania thus needs to regularly engage in innovations and identify relevant productivity enhancing technologies.

The issue of science, technology, innovation and research and development came up in a number of ways during the consultations. With regard to exploitation of natural resources it was pointed out that this is hampered by lack of the necessary national technological capabilities. It was also pointed out that to transform the economy into a modern and competitive one, application of science and technology, innovation and research and development is a prerequisite. The Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and Long Term Perspective Plan for the Mainland and Zanzibar Vision 2020 underline the importance of building an economy buttressed by science and technology. To this end the priority should be to promote science, technology, innovation (STI) and research and development (R&D).

Although Tanzania is committed to embracing science and technology for its social and economic development, significant progress is yet to be realized. For example, the Global Competitiveness Report 2011 shows that Tanzania is not performing well in various aspects such as technological readiness, innovation, higher education and training, and infrastructure. Tanzania's overall competitiveness ranking was 133. This is low, compared with other East African Countries such as Rwanda and Kenya which are at positions 80 and 106 respectively. A similar observation has also been made by other international assessments including those by New Partnership for African Development (NEPAD) and the United Nations.

Tanzania needs to address this situation if she has to benefit from the potentials of STIs for its social and economic development. Therefore deliberate, focused, and sustainable initiatives need to be taken. However, such STIs related initiatives are crosscutting, require high commitment and focused allocation of resources. Therefore STIs stakeholders (i.e. the

government, sponsors, and consumers) need to be adequately informed for making sound decisions for successful STIs initiatives.

(i) *Status of the Infrastructure and Personnel in Higher Education and Research Institutions*

Generally the infrastructure in most STIs, R&D institutions in Tanzania is poorly developed. A number of institutions use old and out of date equipment and technologies. In addition, most of the institutions are under-staffed and lack adequate competent personnel. Thus, besides ensuring that appropriate choices are made about STIs, R&D infrastructure, it is equally important to ensure that sufficient attention is paid to institutional capacity building as well as capacity development. Institutional building focuses on whether institutions have the appropriate systems, procedures and structures to carry out their functions and mandates, while, capacity development is concerned with the professional and continual development of those working in the field of STIs, R&D.

(ii) *Integration of the STIs, R&D System National-Wide*

The implementation of standardized and integrated STIs, R&D system country-wide should be considered as it would enable better management, reporting, decision-making and policy formulation.

(iii) *Adequate Competent Personnel*

STIs, R&D need to acquire adequate competent human resources and separate academic from ICT staff, since dual responsibility is not conducive to either of the two fields of responsibility.

(iv) *Budgeting and Budget Allocation*

Inadequacy of budget allocated to most if not all STIs, R&D institutions is a disquieting and disconcerting situation in a world that is becoming increasingly digitalized. It is therefore recommended that the STIs, R&D operations and related activities should have a separate budget line. In addition the STIs, R&D budget should be given high priority and should at least be equivalent to 5 to 10 percent of the total budget allocated to the institutions.

(v) *STIs, R&D Awareness Creation and Sensitization*

There is also an urgent need to create awareness and sensitize practitioners or make it mandatory for all STIs, R&D institutions to properly budget for their needs. There should also be tailor made training programmes for management teams of the respective STIs, R&D institutions in the country.

(vi) *Publications*

Publications on STIs and R&D are limited and sometimes inaccessible. Limited publication of STIs and R&D information has always been due to lack of research or project funds from which they can generate information for or contents for publishing, or lack of appropriate human resources to undertake research. There is a need for Higher Education Institutions

(HEI) to effectively engage in research and technology development to support the essence of economic growth.

(vii) Patents, Trademark and Industrial Design

Most of the inventions made in Tanzania are not protected. The extent of patenting and Intellectual Property Rights (IPR) is extremely low. One of the reasons why patenting and IPR are uncommon is the fact that the local property rights systems and the legal framework are not supportive. Limited resources allocated to HEIs and R&D Institutions is another reason for the poor performance in this area. Transformation and/or reforms are to be undertaken e.g. to enforce rules and regulations in order to improve patenting and enforcement of property rights.

If STI is to make a tangible impact in the economy, then STI institutions must be allocated the required amount of resources to enable patenting and the use of IPRs.

(viii) Utilization of STI Outputs

The existing poor linkages between researchers and private sector (research outputs are not demand driven) and low awareness of the benefits of outputs affect the utilization of relevant and much needed technical support from research outputs. MIT and other ministries should work together to link research (from R&D, HEIs) with the demands of private sector.

(ix) Indigenous Knowledge

The Government through MCST and MIT should develop policies and programmes to identify and develop unique skills and indigenous knowledge for STI. Local innovators should be made aware of the available opportunities and the importance of managing their IPRs.

(x) Data Collection and Analysis to Inform Policy and Planning

A fundamental tool of STIs, R&D and planning is robust data collection and analysis. Progress and results cannot be measured unless there is a sound statistical basis. Data should be collected, analyzed and made readily available on a regular basis for use to inform policy and planning.. It is thus recommended that STIs, R&D institutions should engage in both data collection and analysis in order to inform the policy process and planning in the country, and that the system should be integrated nation-wide.

3.3 Capacity Development

(a) Introduction

Capacity development is the overarching vehicle in achieving development and is the epicentre of development effectiveness. In its broader sense capacity development refers to the ability of people, organizations and society as a whole to manage their affairs. Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and Zanzibar Vision 2020 view capacity development as the ability to articulate and promote national interests. Capacities are needed to design policies, translate them into development strategies and programmes, devise implementation

modalities, monitor and evaluate their development impact. Capacities go beyond individual experts to include a critical mass of skilled and semi-skilled personnel and indeed the society at large, who should ultimately own the national development agenda. Even more important are institutional capacities for implementation of development programmes, and monitoring the effectiveness of the interventions in order to maximize the development impact. In this regard a number of bottlenecks were pointed out in the consultation processes as discussed below.

(b) Findings

Despite a critical mass of educated and skilled Tanzanians, due to low remuneration, poor working conditions, red tape, etc institutional capacities remain weak. The developmental role of the state needs strengthening through capacitating the planning function and related institutions to plan, oversee and coordinate programme implementation, ensuring value-for-money; and greater involvement of the private sector not just at programme implementation but also in its design. Issues related to low competence and insufficient skilled and specialized manpower should be addressed to salvage programme delivery. This is not limited to the public sector. The Tanzania private sector is also characterised by inadequate capacity of local experts (contractors, engineers, architects, quality surveyors, etc) in terms of numbers, skills and equipment, especially in new and challenging areas such as environment-friendly exploitation and management of natural resources.

(c) Priority Areas, Rationale and Required Actions

The following are the areas which were singled out as priorities for action:

- (i) Establish various initiatives to build skills particularly of women, in emerging new areas such as natural resources management, climate change and environmental sustainability; and science, technology and innovation.
- (ii) Protect and develop indigenous technology, enriched by tapping on technological advances in the industrialized countries through appropriate technology transfer.
- (iii) Enhance research and development (R&D) in universities and other institutions of higher learning and tertiary institutions undertaken by national experts, and where appropriate in partnerships with the external scientific community. Equally important is the adoption of radical innovations on capacities i.e. building of the requisite knowledge and skills for the adaptation of new technologies. The establishment of Polytechnics would support this agenda. In particular it would enhance the production of the hands-on middle level technicians necessary for boosting capacities in small and middle level enterprises.
- (iv) There have been too many ad hoc capacity building programmes based on project-related gap-filling initiatives, often at the instigation of external partners. There is need for a more comprehensive capacity development initiative to assess future capacity needs and to influence training and skills development accordingly.
- (v) There is need for increased national budgets for R&D to support research efforts, without undue dependency on external financial support which tends to set the research agenda, which may be at variance with national needs. This issue is also

illustrated by meagre budgetary allocations for science and technology as detailed below.

- (vi) There is need to invest in improving human capital of the poor, especially women, as well as enhancing community development.
- (vii) There is need to increase support to higher education and skills development through tertiary education; private universities; local content programmes to enhance local skills acquisition and sophistication of local production; retention of experts and transfer of skills from Tanzanians in the Diaspora.

The following are areas that need to be prioritized if Tanzania is to build and sustain institutional and human capacities with the requisite skills and knowledge that meet the demand of the economy.

(i) Investing natural resource rent in human capital development and infrastructure.

The extractive industry is instrumentally valuable for achieving and sustaining human development outcomes. Tanzania needs to build national capacity to exploit these resources and generate value addition. This means that science and technology and geology as well as economics, business, commerce and legal skills need to be strengthened in order to handle mining activities both from the geological and technological aspects as well as from the management and business aspects.

(ii) Prioritizing training and capacity building of the relevant key knowledge areas.

The education system should focus on the relevance of skills offered by institutions in the country to meet the needs of the market. Issues related to low competence and insufficient skilled manpower need to be addressed so that they do not compromise delivery. Proposals were made on the need to review the education curricular to include vocational training from the basic level (primary school) and as a way of imparting entrepreneurship skills among youth to facilitate self-employment. Capacity Development must be based on rigorous needs assessment. Leadership capacities need also to be strengthened at national and sector levels.

(iii) Prioritizing Implementation Effectiveness for Greater Impact and Outcome.

Weaknesses in this area are partly explained by minimal involvement of the intended beneficiaries since most plans are top-down in design. This situation is compounded by policy incoherence, weak synergies and bad sequencing. Managerial capacity will need to be enhanced and good governance embraced in order to ensure effective implementation of policies. Related to this is the need for a strong organizational framework for implementing national development vision, plans and strategies taking into consideration specific material conditions.

(iv) Addressing Institutional Capacities Needs in the Quest for a Better Future.

The developmental role of the state should be stressed and strengthened in order to ensure implementation of set goals to meet the targets.

(v) *Ensuring Greater National Ownership of the Development Agenda.*

There is a need to strengthen and sustain national ownership and leadership of development programmes as a way of developing internal capacity.

3.4 Quality of Education

(a) Findings

The assessment of the progress made toward MDGs is that Tanzania is on track to achieving MDG related to primary education enrolment (MDG2). In education, the achievement is attributed to various policy measures including the introduction of Primary School Education Development Plan (PEDP) and Secondary Education Development Plan (SEDP), as well as increased participation of private sector in the education sector. For the MDG 2, primary education has seen unprecedented achievements. The primary gross enrolment ratio was last reported at 102.28 in 2010, according to a World Bank report published in 2012. The same report has the net enrolment ratio at 95.4%, up from 54.2 in year 1990.

While the majority of those consulted underscored the commendable achievements by the URT in expanding primary school enrolment, many decried the exclusive focus on primary education and called for greater emphasis on post-primary education. Basic education is not completion of primary education, and is not enough to enable a person to participate in society effectively. In Zanzibar, for example, basic education is up to Form Two (2) at secondary level. As a means of reducing poverty, a call is made to increase investment in education to the level of secondary and higher learning institutions, and at the same time, strengthening vocational training for the Youth. The enrolment status at secondary and higher learning education, for example, is not expanding as fast as the high output rate at primary level. The World Bank (2012) report cites the gross enrolment ratios for secondary education at 27.41 in 2009 and higher learning at 2.11 in 2010.

In terms of learning outcomes, many students who complete secondary education find it difficult to find a decent job. This is also the experience of some higher learning institutions graduates. To many, the problem with youth unemployment was argued to be partly as a result of the quality of education provided, which does not impart the required skills, training, and entrepreneurial acumen. This means that targets need to be formulated to monitor secondary, vocational and tertiary levels of education both in terms of enrolment and quality.

Additionally, the education goal is criticized for being too focused on quantity rather than quality; emphasis is often placed on increasing enrolment rates, while the overall quality of education remains a challenge. Education indicators must focus on education outcomes and not only on enrolments. Focus and investment in the education sector should be geared towards creating an environment that offers every child an opportunity to read, learn, develop critical thinking, and acquire important life skills. Quality basic education is the foundation for learning at all levels in order to develop a stable livelihood. It is the surest path out of poverty and despair for thousands of children and youth around the country who share humanity's common dream- the hope for a better life.

Early childhood education needs to be universalized. To this end, targets on early childhood education need to be put in place too.

Apart from emphasizing the importance of quality education delivery, there was also the issue of accessibility and affordability of both primary and secondary education to ensure that education is available to all children, including the most marginalized and vulnerable, and is structured to foster learning and the acquisition of relevant skills. This is important in order to ensure equality in the access to education, particularly to bridge the rural urban divide in terms of the quality of education. Special attention should be placed in ensuring young girls are given the opportunity to complete schooling by tackling the problem early/school pregnancies that lead to drop outs in school. Additionally, some cultural norms need to be revisited and reformed. For example, in some sections of society parents prefer dowry benefits instead of investing in girls' education.

Other emerging issues raised and related to quality were the low number of teachers in schools, and the teachers that are available are in many instances unqualified. Many schools have no science teachers and no laboratories, and suffer from shortages of classrooms, as well as teachers' houses. In addition, direct and indirect expenses and contributions are posing a challenge to most parents. In higher education, opportunities to join are few and students' loans are problematic. School environment was also mentioned as usually unfavourable, with respect to insecurity, children abuse and lack of special facilities for the disabled children.

(b) Priority, Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

It is worth noting that the educational issues which arose during the consultative meetings largely re-affirmed the broad issues identified in other policy processes that dealt with the education issues. With respect to the education goal, the priority issues are divided into three pillars:

- Quality education at all levels;
- Availability of public pre-primary and other early childhood care and education programs;
- Equitable access at all levels of education for all.

Quality education at all levels

As Tanzania seeks to attain high level of human development by 2025 more investments should be channelled towards improving the quality of education and making schools and learning institutions safer. The priority of primary education programmes should focus on learning, less preoccupation with current focus on enrolment. This can be done by aligning incentives of teachers and schools with learning outcomes and by reinvigorating the school inspection programme.

(i) Recruitment of more and better trained teachers should be the main focus.

Teacher recruitment should go hand in hand with expanding enrolment at primary level up to the vocational and tertiary levels. This will improve the teacher/pupil ratio that is currently

far from acceptable standard and is highly inequitable across regions/districts (and wards). There should be better pay for teachers at all levels that will go a long way to retaining the best graduates in order to make the teaching profession an attractive option for the Youth. The recruitment of science teachers should be prioritized.

(ii) *Greater investment in science teaching aid and equipments*

Create an enabling environment for teaching science subjects in schools by building more laboratories. Many schools have no laboratories.

(iii) *Ensure that more investments are directed towards facilities expansion.*

There should be efficient supply and use of resources. Purchase more textbooks and build more libraries at all levels to meet student demands. More classrooms, desks and teachers' houses are needed to be constructed in order to meet demand. Currently, there is acute shortage of classrooms, desks and houses for teachers.

(iv) *Safety of the school environment.*

There is need to improve the learning environment in many schools to allow students to focus on their schooling rather than venturing in other activities that may affect their performances and, ultimately, their future. To avoid students from being abused by their older peers from the surrounding school environment, it is recommended that schools are fenced and where feasible building of police posts closer to the school areas.

Participation in public pre-primary education and other early childhood care and education programs

There is need to encourage and promote pre-primary education and other early childhood care and education programs for all children and ensure expansion of schools similar to that of ward secondary schools.

Pre-primary education plays an important role in children's emotional and cognitive development faculties, the transition from playful learning to formal learning and contributes to children's success at school. Pre-primary education, which concerns children of at least three years of age, must be provided by adequately trained staff.

The government has stated that early childhood education is universal. To this end, targets on early childhood education in both quantity and quality need to be institutionalized.

Equitable access to education for all

(i) *Enhance opportunities for joining higher learning institutions.*

The criteria and facilities for joining universities and colleges should be improved, particularly pertaining to selection and access to loans.

(ii) *Reduce the role of indirect cost at schools and make education affordable for all.*

Costs such as examination fees for form four and registration fees for standard one and kindergarten and other contributions pose a challenge to most parents. Due to low income of many parents many parents/guardians also fail to take their children to school because they cannot afford education expenses like buying uniforms and books and paying school fees and/or compulsory contributions.

(iii) *Improve access to children with disabilities.*

It was noted that most of the physically impaired people do not enjoy opportunity/access to such services like education since only a few of them get admitted into school at older ages than that prescribed in the universal primary education policy. It was reported that, sometimes teachers tend to reject them, asking them to go to schools meant for children with special needs. Currently, those special schools are too few to cater for the special-needy groups.

(iv) *Enhance opportunities for young girls to complete their education.*

Address the challenge of early pregnancies faced by young girls whereby they drop out of school which in turns affects their livelihoods and future. Lack of parents' awareness on the crucial contribution of education to their girl children, especially in rural areas is a major concern. For example, some cultural norms were identified that see no need of investing in girls' education because they are expected to get married after reaching puberty. Deliberate efforts are required to equip girls with life skills, knowledge and information related to their sexual and reproductive health, and ensures that they are able to make informed and the right decisions regarding their own sexuality and have the means to enforce their decisions.

In order to promote and attain basic quality education at all levels, the following measures and/or actions are proposed to be undertaken in the post-2015 agenda:

The education sector should focus on learning outcomes that impart skills which enable students leaving school be competitive and secure jobs, secure livelihoods, and cope with a complex world.

By focusing on these priorities, future generations will be assured of the opportunity to read, learn, develop critical thinking, and acquire important life skills. Quality basic education is the foundation for learning in school, developing a stable livelihood, and becoming a responsible, productive member of society.

- (i) Strengthen quality and improve access to primary and secondary education by: increasing recruitment of qualified teachers; teacher training and professional development; equity of teacher placements and increasing classrooms.
- (ii) Align national education plans and policies to standards-based at primary and secondary level and effectively track and measure learning outcomes (read and write etc. What the students can do at their level)
- (iii) Invest in the educational infrastructure at primary and secondary, tertiary and vocational education by: building more classrooms, laboratories, libraries, houses

- for teachers, fences; purchase desks and textbooks, and ensure that food is provided at schools for students
- (iv) Establish and expand universal pre-primary public schools and other early childhood education programmes
 - (v) Invest in tertiary education to allow higher enrolment rates of students with access to loans
 - (vi) Improve access of education to all children, especially those with disabilities and ensure a better environment for their learning.
 - (vii) Ensure that all girls are able to complete their education
 - (viii) Invest in entrepreneurship education and skills particularly for the school drop outs and those who missed chances to enter higher learning institutions.

3.5 Access and Quality of Health Care Services and Non-Communicable Diseases

(a) Findings

Like in the case of education and other social services, access to better health services have been widely pointed out. Limited access to better health service by the majority of the people continued to undermine health outcomes. This has been evidenced among others through higher rate of maternal and infant mortality, outbreak of cholera, incidences of tuberculosis, etc. With respect to nutrition about 42 percent of children under-five years of age have low height for age or stunted, 5 percent have low weight for height or wasted and 16 percent have low weight for age reflecting both chronic and acute under nutrition

With regard to maternal mortality, the status indicates that maternal mortality ratio ranges from 353 to 556 deaths per 100,000 live births as at 2010. Such high level undermines progress towards achieving MDG5 target of 133 deaths per 100,000 live births in 2015.

Several factors have been pointed out to hamper access to the needed health services across communities. The factors have been clustered in the following dimensions: geographical access (service location, household location); availability (poor infrastructure, lack or gaps in knowledge by health personnel, inappropriate application of available technology, lack of drugs and low quality of drugs, etc); affordability (cost and prices of services, household resources and willingness to pay); and acceptability (characteristics of health services, and user attitudes and expectations).

In addition, inadequate effective enforcement of health policies such as free health services, etc that aim at supporting special groups including pregnant women, children, elders, undermine further health outcomes. Strategic interventions and measures that aim at addressing both demand side factors (factors influencing the ability to use health services) and supply side factors (aspects inherent to the health system that hinder service uptake) are necessary. Both sides of the problem have to be addressed concurrently since access barriers may not always be mutually exclusive and may interact and reinforce each other.

Furthermore communicable and other tropical diseases such as malaria, diarrhoea, HIV/AIDS, etc as well as pneumonia, malnutrition and complications of low birth weight continue to overburden the health care system. It is argued that significant numbers of outpatients is largely due to communicable diseases. More efforts and strategies are required in order to fight against such diseases. One among the strategies is to continue improve the environment that will attract more private health service providers. This is because private sector has recently emerged as the predominant source of ambulatory care, especially on diagnosis and treatment for most communicable diseases.

Another health related issue observed is the rapid emergency of non-communicable diseases. Non-communicable diseases such as cancer, cardiovascular diseases and diabetes are increasingly common in the country. Such diseases currently account for most deaths and their prevalence is rising. Urgent (preventive) actions are called upon as well as efficient strategies to deal with risk factors like smoking, alcohol, promiscuity, physical inactivity; etc particularly among youth should be given utmost attention.

(b) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

As discussed in the previous section, quality and access to better health service to all and across communities as well as emerging of non-communicable diseases are continuing to undermine health outcomes. However, since resources are limited, it is important to prioritize areas that are perceived to have effective impact. The following are areas that have been identified for action:

(i) Capacity building, Incentive Structure and Resource Management

Gaps in knowledge and incompetence among health personnel are one among the noted features that undermine provision of quality health service, for example, 51 percent of births were subsequently assisted by skilled birth attendant in 2010 and only one in five women who require emergency obstetric care actually receive it. Lack of knowledge creates chances for incorrect medication and inappropriate application of available technology and thus account for negligence death. This calls for efforts toward skills development among health personnel as well as proper management and rationalization the distribution of both human and financial resources in the health sector. In addition, there is a need to create an incentive structure that may first retain health personnel in the country, and secondly, attract health professions to the underserved areas.

(ii) Facilities and Infrastructure Development:

One among the factors that account for higher rate of maternal mortality is poor environment. Experience has shown that due to poor hospital environment with lack of facilities and drugs, many pregnant women decide to take the risk of delivering out of health centres and thus increase the likelihood of death. This calls for improving hospitals' environment through better supplies and facilities, including quality drugs/medicine as well as creating new infrastructures. Such development could as well be undertaken through the use of Public-Private Partnership framework.

(iii) Effective Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Framework

Lack of an effective M&E framework undermines efficacy and progress in the health sector. This includes lack of the capacity of receiving feedback on the interventions undertaken. For example the emergence of non-communicable diseases, calls for developing indicators that will help the existing frameworks to monitor progress and the impact of interventions. The sheer lack of such indicators does affect the capacity of undertaking changes, if strategies appear not to be working or simply need fine-tuning. Therefore, it is important to ensure that there is an effective M&E mechanism that may well guide decisions for better health outcomes.

(iv) Accountability Mechanism:

Instituting a system of accountability on the part of the medical staff is important in order to minimize deaths due to negligence. Each maternal death and other death events need to be investigated to understand the causes, including causes that have to do with poor medical attention and corrective measures need to be continuously taken. The strategy could be to institute a counter checking mechanism so as to avoid doing business as usual.

(v) Enforcement and Effective Policies:

Several good policies are reported to be in place that is focusing on ensuring universal access to health services in the country. However, lack of enforcement to implement established policies undermines the outcomes of several health initiatives; for example free medical services to pregnant women, children, elders, and other vulnerable/special groups. This calls for the need to revisit and strengthen institutional capacities of the health sector. Other area that requires strategic intervention in order to address issues of accessibility is to introduce universal health insurance coverage. Such arrangement may help to address not only issues of accessibility but also equity and equality in the utilization of health services.

(a) Establish Universal Health Insurance Coverage

Development of universal health insurance that will cover all people across the communities will help to enhance accessibility to better health care by all including the poor. However a proper structure of the framework that best accommodate local settings will have better outcomes. More resources are also call upon to be budgeted to finance the structure. Strategic interventions leading to improved universal access to sexual and reproductive health services including family planning services will significantly improve the maternal health outcomes by ensuring that those who need and cannot access family planning services will receive, most of who are poor and marginalized women. This will in turn reduce fertility rates amongst the poorest and promote empowerment of women; key to sustainable development. By ensuring women's reproductive rights would mean that women are having children by choice and not by chance, and thus increase the probability of women to being productive.

(b) Address issues related to Malnutrition, access to Water and Sanitation

Lack of safe and clean water across communities and especially in schools is issues that call the utmost attention and intervention so as to enhance the status of the public health. Lack of access to safe water undermines all other efforts in health sector in addressing public health

especially with regards to communicable diseases. Availability of clean and safe water will likely to reduce the number of patients demanding health services especially those suffer from transmitted diseases such as cholera, etc which are results of poor hygiene. Such decline of patients creates ample resource capacity for provision of better and quality health care. It is important to enhance effort towards allocation of more resources to increase supply of safe and clean water within communities. Such efforts in conjunction with, continuous sanitation education campaigns/awareness to the community will help to improve public health. Equally important is the need to ensure nutrition security.

3.6 Management of Natural Resources

(a) Introduction

Tanzania is rich in natural resources endowment that range from forestry and wildlife to mineral resources; natural gas to fish; and attractive mountains to a long and beautiful coastline blessed with abundant marine resources and exceptionally attractive beaches. However, these natural resources are not properly harnessed and taxed. Domestic resources do not sufficiently benefit the country as a whole.

(b) Findings

Many participants acknowledged that Tanzania is endowed with vast natural resources such as land, water, wildlife, fisheries, forest, minerals etc. They felt that the post-2015 economy in Tanzania will be heavily driven by the natural resources through responsible exploitation of natural gas, coal, uranium and other non-renewable resources.

The effectiveness of all policies to manage risks associated with natural resources requires a strong institutional framework that ensures that there is no corruption, the rule of law is adhered to, and generally there is strong governance. It is proposed to ensure that there are independent, accountable and transparent institutions that can help the government manage the proceeds from natural resources. Important here and with respect to Tanzania is that, establishing strong institutions prior to the exploitation of the resource is the safest way to avoid the so called natural resources curse.

The existing resource potential in Tanzania has created a lot of optimism in the country. However, participants in the preparation for the post-MDG agenda were concerned about the country suffering the same fate that has befallen a number of developing countries, whereby domestic resources are ripped off by greedy people for their benefit. Unless there is a genuine government and political commitment (which is currently lacking), and adequate capacity in public resource management, Tanzania may not be able to eliminate underdevelopment during the Post MDGs.

(c) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

It is imperative to ensure good governance, a proper institutional framework as well as the law enforcement to curb the rampant illegal exports of natural resources. An equitable

sharing mechanism must be put in place to guarantee equitable benefit sharing not only between multinationals (investing in the country) and Tanzania, but also among Tanzanians.

Currently, the extractive industry is one of the fastest growing industries in Tanzania. If these natural resources are properly managed, harnessed and taxed, no doubt the country would become self-reliant in financing both recurrent and development or capital expenditure. The discovery of natural gas with the likelihood of discovery of fossil fuel; together with proven uranium reserves may make Tanzania a prominent player in extractive resources. Tanzania needs to significantly improve resource management and particularly tapping resource rent and ensure a sustainable utilization of the same. The resource rent collected by the government is a critical factor to sustain benefits from non-renewable resources rent by way of re-investing the revenues from these resources in infrastructure, human capital, and capital reserve, to guarantee a stable productive capacity of the economy. Fiscal discipline is therefore important to ensure sufficient investment in human capital, infrastructures and other development pillars in the country. This is an important measure because it will ensure that part of the proceeds from natural resources are invested in projects that increases the productivity of the whole economy.

According to Water Point Mapping surveys (WaterAid Tanzania, 2009) conducted in 51 districts in 2009, only 54% of the then existing rural water-points were functional. Even very new water-points had problems. Almost half of all investment in rural water supply was effectively wasted. Sustainability of rural water projects in Tanzania remains a big challenge. The current status of water resource in Tanzania is largely the outcome of poor and unsustainable management of water resource including the water-points and water sources. Such an outcome calls for the need to make management of natural resources one of the development priorities for Tanzania during the Post-MDGs period. Unless environmental rules and regulations are enforced; sustainability of such resources is impracticable.

In addition to a few measures proposed earlier, the capacity development, science and technology and good governance are also paramount. Since the national capacity on sustainable resource management, strategic resource allocation and efficient resource utilization is lacking, there is an urgent need to build the required capacities at all levels to enable the country sustain its resource base, exploit its resource base to foster economic growth. This means that science and technology as well as geology, economics, business, commerce and legal studies (including contractual arrangements with companies investing in the industry) need to be enhanced to ensure that there is adequate local capacity to manage the process of resource exploitation and utilization. To ensure good governance in resource management, resource exploitation must be transparent, among other requirements.

Also it is important to emphasize is the preferential treatment of custodians of the resource base. To ensure a balanced growth and development, people within the vicinity of the areas where natural resources are exploited must be given some kind of preferential treatment in terms of benefiting from the natural resources because they also bear the burden of environmental pressure and the general changes in their social economic structure due to new

developments in their locality. This is particularly so for the marginalized regions in Tanzania.

In addition, the effectiveness of all policies to manage risk associated with natural resources requires a strong institutional framework that ensures that there is no corruption; rule of law is adhered to, and that there is strong governance. Independent, accountable and transparent institutions can help the government manage the proceeds from natural resources. Important here and with respect to Tanzania is that, establishing strong institutions prior to the exploitation of the resource is the safest way to avoid the curse. Lastly, it is equally important to invest in human development, social protection programmes and environmental protection.

Promote human development by investing the proceeds from natural resources: For those natural resources that are non-renewable, exploration is limited in time. Sound wealth management suggests that assets should not be used to finance non-productive projects; in other words, natural assets should only be transformed into other types of productive assets. To increase the assets of a given society and also to diversify its productive capacity, a large bulk of natural resource proceeds could be used to expand education, health, water, sanitation, energy (power), roads, other infrastructure and other long-term investment projects. Using the proceeds to finance investment in different types of capital instead of public or private consumption is desirable for two reasons. First, it limits the impact of the Dutch disease, because when it comes to infrastructure, in particular, it will increase the demand for imports. Second, it allows for increases in the productivity of the economy and the country as a whole.

Tanzania must also spend part of the proceeds on a social protection programme. There is strong evidence that poor households embark in practices that are not efficient when they face risks. They, for instance, reduce their food intake or take children out of school which has long-term implications on their productivity (as well as impact on their levels of human development). Social protection is very important in these cases, as it could provide an efficiency boost to local economies, allowing poor households to improve their decision-making. Using natural resource revenues for social protection would then have a positive feedback effect and long-term benefits in terms of risk management for poor households. For this to be correctly implemented, however, government will need to map out inefficient practices that poor households use to cope with risk and shocks.

There is a critical need to ensure that environmental factors feature at the strategic stage of the investment decision making. Environmental issues are rarely considered in the early stages of the investment process in some of the projects. This failing is reinforced a little bit by initiatives such as the Natural Resources Charter, which only introduces environmental considerations at the project planning stage – not the policy development and assessment or investment appraisal stages. It should be avoided for strategic decisions about investments to be made on the basis of political and financial considerations alone.

This is also supported by not only the National Vision 2025, but also both, the national Five Years Development Plan (FYDP) and the Long-Term Perspective Plan (LTPP) where the government has reiterated its intention to put in place mechanisms for maximizing the collection of resource rents from existing natural resources. Steps such as auctioning of hunting blocks or trophies and maximizing both taxes and royalties from mineral resources will be put in place to ensure these natural resources become an important source of financing the Medium Term Plan. In order to ensure enhancement of income from the country's vast mineral resources, an innovative taxation mechanism will be introduced, on top of increased domestic investors' participation in mineral extraction and processing.

3.7 Climate Change Adaptation and Energy

(a) Introduction

During the consultation process, MDG Goal-7, ensuring environmental sustainability, was invariably related with consequences of the current phenomenon of *Climate Change*. It was noted that poverty is increasingly associated with natural disasters attributed to the effects of Climate Change, such as drought and lack of energy. Climate change was shown to have effects on agriculture, marine resources (mangrove forest and fish), water supply, coastal village are washes away and fishing as means of livelihood (especially for coastal families).

The perceptions derived from the consultation in regard to the climate change phenomenon are summarized below:

(b) Findings

(i) *Climate change and environmental changes are among the factors that contribute to increased poverty*

Incomes of many rural households are contingent upon vagaries of weather, and there is a feeling (now supported by scientific evidence) that this has a negative impact on agriculture, infrastructure (floods), etc. What the participants were actually referring to is climate change. The views expressed argued that intervention for poverty reduction should thus be addressing the impacts of climate change. It was explained that the effect of climate change on local communities differs from one type of livelihood to another. In some cases, the pastoralist societies are the hardest hit compared to crop farmers.

(ii) *Social Burden of Climate Change*

The impact of climate change was also widely discussed in relation to the issue of water availability, especially on consequences of drought, which very much affect their activities domestically and in the field. As indicated before for instance, women who walk long distances to fetch water spend less time on carrying out productive economic activities.

In process of looking for water some women and girls have also suffered from other calamities, like rape or wild animal attacks. Some of the girls that suffered from rape end up getting pregnant and hence the increased incidences of school dropouts, which actually affect

their learning process. It was further argued that affordability of water services where it is provided has been another challenge.

(iii) Effect of Sea level rise and increase in sea surface temperature

The stakeholders pointed out various happenings that have been observed along the coastal areas in Tanzania, such as advancing of the ocean water towards the land, washed away homes and reduced fish catch. Such rising tides are associated with sea level rises, which subject coastal villages to flooding and intrusion of salt water that contaminates the sources of village water supply.

In Zanzibar islands the effects of climate change have caused fertile arable land to submerge under the ocean. These changes have forced some of the households along the coastal areas to seek for alternative livelihood for survival and thus affect their well-being. It was also found out that salt water intrudes to sources of cooking and drinking water (wells).

It is been indicated that such effects of climate change which are brought about the sea level rise and increase sea surface temperature are likely to affect the existing biodiversity. To this effect, during the consultation process some stakeholders complained that mangroves are being affected and that some species of fishes are not as common as they use to be.

(c) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

The consequences of climate change were widely referred to as among the important emerging issues during MDG implementation process. These references on climate change effects were reported by various stakeholders. Due to different factors, response to the consequences of climate change might need different adaptation strategies across various sectors and regions.

Since the negative effects of climate change are taking a heavy toll on the livelihoods of many people in Tanzania, as in other developing countries, the consultations participants expressed the need to address the concerns with concerted efforts from both at national and global levels.

At the national level, more efforts and capacity are needed to adapt to climate and to provide alternative sources of household energy, energy that is clean and sustainable.

At the global level for the developed countries, they have moral responsibility to undertake measures aimed at controlling activities inducing the release GHGs; in effect the focus should be on controlling activities that harm the environment as well as installing adaptation and mitigation measures. To achieve this, bolder support to developing countries from developed countries will need to be forthcoming (the principle of Polluter Pays is proposed in this regard).

Climate change poses a serious risk to on-going poverty reduction efforts and threatens to reverse decades of development efforts. It affects different sectors at different levels and is

thus poised to undermine national efforts to attain both the national objectives as well as Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The impacts of climate change are and will continue to be more pronounced in poor countries. Yet these countries have contributed the least to the problem and are the ones least able to cope with the impacts. The poor are particularly sensitive to climate change because they lack an effective coping mechanism and means to manage shocks, and because given their low income levels, they are more vulnerable to shocks emanating from climate change.

Climate change is currently topical within Tanzania, within the Africa region and at global level. The expected impending impacts of climate change to different sectors and how to mitigate and or adapt to them are the main concerns being articulated by various actors. Agriculture for example, is among the most affected sectors in Tanzania, as particularly most of it is rain fed, with rain being affected most from changing climate. Thus the justification for seriously dealing with climate change is supported by the following reasoning:

- Climate change poses a risk to poverty reduction efforts.
- Most people have limited means of mitigating or coping with climate change disasters.
- Country capacity to meet effective management is limited.
- Climate change effects impinge mostly on agriculture sector in the wider sense.
- Needed measures require more financial resources and investments.

The measures for climate change adaptation have to be realistic and manageable.

(i) Measures to be Implemented by Local Institutions and Communities

A number of actions are necessary to curb or arrest the outcome of climate change. Some of them have to be taken simultaneously. These measures include stepped-up public awareness, increased resources, and capacity building of various key players in the relevant sectors. All the key stakeholders need to be mobilized if this initiative is to be successful. Likewise, the country needs to mobilize various institutions to fully participate in this process in terms of advocacy, alert systems, early warning systems, preventive services as well as in dealing with climate change disasters when they strike.

Specific examples of sectors requiring short-term and even long term attention are in the waters and land sectors. Sustainable land use planning and management, which takes into account effects of climate change was ardently stressed in Zanzibar, which has limited land area. It was suggested to address land use challenges, through proper land use planning and ensure effective enforcement of existing laws and regulations, especially those related to land deforestation.

(ii) Role of international community to climate change

Development Partners also have the big role to play in terms of providing technical advice and support and to facilitate institutional development.

It has been suggested that environment and climate change should be approached in a holistic manner with new and strong implementable international commitments. This requires heightened political will among international leaders, to commit to many international environment conferences and agreements (e.g. Kyoto, Copenhagen etc.). The world needs not only commitment, but also effective implementation, to lead to tangible results in the implementation of MDGs. What has been noted so far is that, negotiations at international fora are mainly top-down (bulldozed by more developed and powerful countries), oftentimes failing to reflect and capture priorities and interest of developing countries.

(iii) Energy including renewable energy issues

There has been unanimous that the next round of development goals, in line with Rio +20, should address the issue of green economy, alternative (renewable) sources of energy, etc. Support to the introduction and scaling up usage of alternative sources is the credible solution to deforestation challenges.

Universal energy access is the most pressing energy issue in post 2015. Sustainable economic growth and social-wellbeing cannot be achieved in Tanzania and Sub-Saharan Africa without access to affordable modern energy services. Interlinked issues of energy availability, affordability and quality of energy, especially for rural population, were raised. Joint action by all stakeholders in the public sector, donor community, multilateral institutions, private sector, and civil society (including youth groups) will have to engage in energy matters.

Further, national goals should prioritize energy and mainstream issues of energy across all sectors. International support should build on national policies and needs in terms of provision of finance for infrastructure projects and research and development.

3.8 Good Governance

(a) Introduction

Governance has been defined as “the exercise of political, economic and administrative authority to manage a nation’s affairs”. Good governance is a function of successful interaction among key state institutions on the one hand, and their interface with the civil society including the private sector on the other. Good democratic governance is the bedrock of growth, poverty eradication and sustainable human development. It entails moral, ethical and cultural uprightness; respect for the rule of law, human rights and rights to development; absence of widespread corruption; and determination and ownership of a society’s own development agenda.

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) did not explicitly address governance issues but subsumed them in MDG1 on “eradication of extreme poverty and hunger” and MDG8 on “developing a global partnership for development”. Only good governance practices will promote both the mobilisation of local and external resources and their prudent utilization for pro-poor growth and development. It is proposed to prioritize “governance” in the post-2015

global development framework, especially since it will be centred on the core values of human rights, equality and sustainability.

This report therefore addresses the key governance issues of democratic decentralized governance; participatory development management; transparency and accountability; the rule of law and human rights, which emerged as the main concerns in the post-MDGs stakeholder consultations. The latter benefited from the National Vision(s) and the Long-Term Perspective Plan, all of which underscored the centrality of improved governance for growth and development. In particular, they envisage (i) prevalence of the rule of law; (ii) government accountability to the people; (iii) deepening of democracy, political openness and tolerance; (iv) sustenance of peace, political stability, national unity and security; and (v) active participation in the maintenance of regional peace and security.

(b) Findings

After the introduction of plural political systems in 1992, Tanzania has witnessed improved encouraging political, economic and administrative governance, more especially in the areas of democracy, political tolerance, national cohesion and business climate. After years of political acrimony and tension in Zanzibar especially after the 2000 elections were put to rest, an inclusive government of national unity in 2010 has stabilized Zanzibar politics and ended social tension.

Practices of good democratic governance are emerging: maintenance of sustainable peace and security and macro-economic stability. Political leaders are by and large freely elected through inter-party competition, albeit in some cases uneven playing fields. There is a vibrant print and electronic media that promotes civic education and criticizes shortcomings in the body polity. More significantly various governance institutions have been established including the Electoral and Human Rights Commissions.

However, the challenge is the credibility, trustworthiness and efficacy of these and other governance institutions. The Prevention and Combating of Corruption Bureau (PCCB), for instance, has failed to arrest high level corruption as the annual Controller and Auditor General's (CAG) reports have indicated. Both the 2013 country Africa Peer Review Mechanism (APRM) and the post-2015 Agenda consultations have highlighted the following challenges: corruption; poor service delivery; over-centralization of power especially in the Presidency; devolution and empowerment of sub-national governance systems and the sustenance of the Tanganyika-Zanzibar union..

The rule of law and human rights are the "building blocks" for a just, fair and equitable developmental state. It is an integral part of the overall broader development thrust. However, due to weaknesses in governance institutions especially the criminal justice system (the Courts, the Police, the office of the Director of Public Prosecutions, etc), not unrelated to limited wherewithal to deliver justice and fair play, the poor and other vulnerable groups are disadvantaged. In this regard although legislation is in place there is weak law enforcement.

In recent years, as alluded to before governance has been eroded by significant decline in social values, morality, ethics, national cohesion and pride. Many of the governance institutions are racing with rapidly changing development scenarios and hence the need for addressing their feeble capacities.

(c) Priority Issues, Rationale and Required Actions

(i) Enhanced Democratic Governance:

Nursing a culture of constitutional democracy is important to good governance. It will ensure judicious and cost-effective use of resources and non-marginalisation of vulnerable groups. Its key elements include, (i) inclusive, participatory and consultative processes in policy development including where appropriate bottom-up approaches; and decentralized governance system;

(ii) The Rule of Law and due process:

This is based on the understanding that all are equal before the law. It should ensure predictable, stable environment with individual rights upheld by an independent, impartial and functioning legal system. Because of inequalities (financial, knowledge, political power, information, etc) actualization of this objective is not within reach. Nor is there much on-top political will to enforce it. This has led into situations whereby ordinary folks have taken the law into their own hands.

(iii) Human Rights:

The zeal to protect and promote human rights and the rights to development in post 2015 is required. The latter should be enforced by a strong Bill of Rights enshrined in the constitution. Mainstreaming of the rights approach to development programming should be a priority.

(iv) Transparency and Accountability:

Is necessary to build public confidence in government, promote sound financial and economic management and contribute to a predictable economic climate.

(v) Devolution and decentralized governance:

Decentralization and participatory decision-making processes at different levels of state, and enhanced civil society and local community participation and empowerment.

(vi) Sound budgetary policies and priorities:

It is important in ascertaining efficient management of public funds and especially central and local government discretionary use of financial resources.

(vii) Administrative and bureaucratic consistency

Fruitful interaction between state and civil society, ensuring public concerns are made known to policy makers and feedback is provided. In this and other areas leadership is crucial.

Required Actions thus include strengthen institutional and legal framework for democracy, rule of law, due process and overall good governance, through: (a) Reviewing, mainstreaming, accelerating and deepening implementation of core reforms to create an enabling environment for pro-poor growth; (b) Enhancing the operational capacity of governance institutions; (c) Strengthening the legal framework for, and rights to, development.

Improved Transparency and Accountability and Curbing Corruption, through: (a) Strengthening mechanisms for accountability and smart sanctions on implementation, enforcement and compliance to legislative, policy, regulatory and operational rules; (b) Strengthening “checks and balances” including bottom-up approaches, to inform policy development and monitor its implementation; (c) Public accountability, whereby central and local governments and their employees are held responsible for their actions; (d) Strengthened Tender Boards and transparent tendering processes; (e) Promotion of meritocracy in public employment, promotion and contracting.

Up-scaling the Fight Against Corruption is required by: (a) Revising and tightening anti-graft laws; (b) Strengthening mechanisms for fighting corruption and money laundering including coping with rapid technological advances; (c) increased modernisation of court operations and legal registries through development of electronic case management system and streamlining of the manual case flow system currently in place; (d) Strengthening the capacity of the PCCB; (e) Inter-institutional collaboration between law enforcement agencies (police, immigration, drug enforcement, PCCB, etc) for easy forestalling and detection of crime and the pursuit against criminals; (f) Protection of records and “whistle blowers” of criminal activity for prosecution, now and in the future; (g) Improve public sector financial management, including a more transparent control and management of government budgets; (h) Work with Interpol and sub-regional police coordination mechanisms to arrest cross-border crime(drugs, small arms and human trafficking, smuggling, cattle rustling, etc).

Strengthening the Rule of Law and Human Rights will be achieved via: (a) Strengthening and giving “teeth” to the Human Rights Commission, beyond mere reporting of breaches of human rights, such as prosecution of offenders; (b) Inclusion of a well articulated Bill of Rights in the new Constitution; and pursuing its implementation; and, (c) The mainstreaming of the “rights to development” in national development frameworks and policies.

Promoting a developmental “mind set” will particularly entail: Sensitization of youths for behavioural change to enhance patriotism, ethics and integrity.

There is need, perhaps taking advantage of the stakeholder consultation reports, to undertake comprehensive governance capacity assessments for possible design of governance institutional capacity building programmes. This could feed into the roll-out of the new Constitution.

3.9 Inequality and Social Protection

(a) Introduction

Social protection measures reduce poverty and contribute to economic growth by addressing the multiple risk sources of the poorest and most vulnerable members of society—including children. Other forms of social vulnerability particularly of youth girls reflects a pattern of often unplanned pregnancies, early marriage and childbearing, resulting from practices that increase girls' vulnerability to marginalisation and extreme poverty. Society's acceptability of wife beating and women's experience of sexual violence further marginalises women and girls. In Tanzania, approximately 15% of women undergo FGM/C female genital mutilations/cutting ; despite it being an illegal practice since 1998, increasingly younger children and even baby girls below age one are subjected to it. Given this context, for a Tanzanian woman to have the ability to make autonomous informed decisions about her life, her sexuality and reproduction, free from any form of discrimination, coercion and violence much more investment needs to be made in improving the policies and practices that govern their lives.

The government of the United Republic of Tanzania (URT) has already made significant progress in developing a range of social protection interventions. In particular, the development of the National Social Protection Framework has helped to pull together the different policies and programs related to improving social protection and reduce inequality. Also, special protection measures to prevent violence against women including protection from harmful practices such as FGM special protection measures to prevent violence against women including protection from harmful practices such as FGM are required. On economic front interventions in social protection are varied and include: food aid, public works programs; savings and insurance mechanisms; cash transfers; and social welfare programs.

(b) Findings

The discussion on whether or not the gap between those who live well and those who do not is growing in Tanzania produced mixed results. While the salaried group of (LGAs) or people assured of income are of the view that the gap has been growing overtime, small-scale farmers, pastoralists, small-scale fishermen and petty traders had the view that the gap is narrowing. However, it was discovered that the responses are divergent because the two groups use different indicators to assess the inequality. Despite the differences, the potent observation was that inequality continued to exist with more disparities across regions. The spatial differences or inequalities are also revealed among people living urban and rural areas. Forward and backward linkages of agriculture and the critical importance of agricultural growth in producing income and food were seen as having effect on reducing the noted disparities. However, emphasis should not lose sight of existing inequalities within the urban areas i.e. between the rich and the poor. Efforts of formalizing the informal sector ensure that rights of small scale traders are protected and access to social services are important as a way of addressing inequalities in urban areas.

Likewise, it has been argued that social protection can increasingly be a key instrument to contribute to poverty reduction and to sustainable development. This is because vulnerability

among the majority of the people is high. Large numbers of people, due to vulnerability, face the risk of becoming poor or face transitory poverty. Even though there is a large need, it was revealed that social protection policy and framework available are very limited in terms of actual implementation to cover all people; in the economy. The framework covers a small percentage of the population in the country; it limited especially to those in the formal sector. There is lack of effective schemes that covers peasants or labourers in the agriculture sector, the informal economy, or those in the formal sector who are temporarily employed. So most people's incomes are subject to the variations typical in agricultural activity or the fortuity of informal activities, which themselves may fluctuate considerably. Add to this: the environment, the regular calamities of nature and man, and the uncertainty of life are enormous.

It was argued that traditional societies have developed mechanisms to deal with these uncertainties, and considerable amount of work has been done to describe the social protection mechanisms. The adequacy and coverage of these mechanisms is not sufficiently understood. However, under the social protection mechanisms in traditional societies, the case is that the elderly work longer later in life. The elderly have to provide for themselves either totally or partially. Moreover, traditional societies are in the process of transformation and social cohesion may be deteriorating. Already it is reported that poverty among the elderly remaining in the countryside may well be on the increase.

Therefore, instituting social protection policies and programmes is very important in these cases.

(c) Priority issues, Rationale and Required Actions

There are a number of areas that require more efforts in order to address issues of inequality and social protection in the country. However strategic efforts should be directed to sectors in which the majority of low income earners are employed, in this case in agriculture sector.

Likewise in addressing issues of safety nets, and more broadly social protection, a comprehensive framework for social security, including health insurance, should be instituted as a measure of reducing risk of being poor and a framework of tackling poverty among the vulnerable and marginalized groups. Thus put in place a social protection scheme to cater for all people, particularly the poor, with special focus on improving conditions that are supportive to women.

A comprehensive national system of social protection will help to provide adequate coverage to needy groups and increased protection to the most vulnerable people especially elderly, people living with long illness, persons addicted to drugs/alcohol and vulnerable youths.

Reduction in poverty (income poverty in particular), has not been sizeable even in countries where economic growth has been rated satisfactory. Some of the sections of the societies have been left out of the growth process, notably the unemployed, some of those depending

overly on rain-fed agriculture; those affected by lack of capital to establish stable businesses; and lack of education.

As discussed in the previous section, majority of the people have no protection in the event of livelihood shocks or severe deprivation. A small number mostly wealthy people living in urban areas have formal social security and health insurance with modest benefits. Children's care and development in Tanzania suffers from severe domestic insecurity. There are many children who have lost both parents or are abandoned. Some 5 - 17 year olds are engaged in child labour.

The marginalized groups, e.g. the aged people, unemployed youth, etc. could be effectively be transformed if government operates safety net and social protection policies. During the consultations it was clearly implied that the area of social protection is the dimension which has been omitted in the list of current policies.

Other measures required for income and social protection are as follows:

Addressing Inequality:

- (i) Increase incentives and subsidies to agriculture sector;
- (ii) Enhance intervention on price fluctuations
- (iii) Provide education to communities;
- (iv) Provide civic education to all people in the community especially educating against corruption and installing integrity in managing public funds.

Addressing Social Inequality:

For the Elderly:

- (i) Scale up the counselling efforts to raise awareness in the community on the need to respect and support the poor elderly people
- (ii) Enhance more efforts on disseminating information on the rights of the elderly to community members as well as to the elderly themselves especially to the poor elderly so that they become aware of their rights and can improve their access to basic services
- (iii) Raise awareness on the need to integrate rather than isolate the elderly from their households and the community, so as to benefit from community care system.
- (iv) Subsidize or exempt the elderly in the community from cost sharing in health services to enable them to accessing these services
- (v) Establish an elderly person's social security that is suitable to the economic and socio-cultural context obtaining in Tanzania.

People-Living with long Illness

- (i) Scale up the programmes and related initiatives to support persons living with long illness particularly through the home based care system.

- (ii) Support programmes which build the capacity of local authorities and other institutions which can support parents, relatives and guardians caring for people living with long illness.

Persons addicted to drugs and or alcohol

- (a) Scale up programmes and other initiatives to support the vulnerable youth in prevention and rehabilitation, extend the service to other areas of the country, especially in small towns.
- (b) Build up capacity of district councils to support parents and guardians with children and young people who need treatment and rehabilitation
- (c) Scale up awareness raising activities among school age children on the consequences of drug abuse
- (d) Facilitate access to credit to the youth, both in urban and in rural areas to enable them engage in productive activities.

Women:

- (i) Implement existing laws and frameworks for elimination of violence against women laws
- (ii) Publicise and implement programmes that can prevent harmful traditional practices such as FGM
- (iii) Change the legal age at marriage to be at least 18 for girls.
- (iv) Ensure that all girls, pregnant or not can continue schooling.
- (v) Make available quality family planning programmes in every community so that women can freely decide if and when to have children. So that all individuals and couples poor or not can access their right to choose.

Vulnerable Youths

- (a) Facilitate training of youth on entrepreneurship and business skills, including credit management
- (b) Strengthen the efforts which enhance gender participation for all age groups, and raise awareness and contribution of youth in the decision making process
- (c) Improve access to credit services to enable the youth to engage in income generating activities
- (d) Enhance awareness raising and social mobilization to stakeholders and community as a whole to change attitudes towards the role and rights of children and young people.
- (e) Develop an effective mechanism to support children from poor households in the rural areas who are unable to pursue further studies such as secondary schools even if selected, because they cannot meet school financing needs.
- (f) Invest in Adolescents and youth Sexual reproductive rights, especially among adolescent girls from the poorest household is strategic for Tanzania. This investment will lead to breaking the chain of intergenerational poverty as most girls will stay in school longer, delay pregnancies and ultimately have fewer children. The diversity of the youth group requests the investment to consider special approaches of reaching the poor, marginalized and vulnerable adolescent girls.

3.10 Global Issues

The various national consultation processes brought to the fore issues of global dimensions either as extension of national issues (such as call for international support) or stand-alone issues generated by global such as the Millennium Declaration of year 2000. The issues of global dimensions include the following:

Development Cooperation: The main reason for taking Development Cooperation as future agenda lies in non-delivery on commitments by developed nations such as setting aside the required level of GNI for supporting development efforts in developing countries. Also, dependency on aid by LDCs is not declining fast enough to bring new aspirations in the future. Further international cooperation will thus be required *albeit* in a more improved form.

(a) Findings

The consultations revealed that international commitments have not been forthcoming in the magnitude and timing that was given as commitment. The impact of this has been deleterious especially on development programmes which are to a larger extent donor-supported. At the national level, the national budget has shown very slow progress towards moving away from donor dependence.

(b) Priority Areas, Rationale and Required Actions

The areas that need high priority were pointed out as development effectiveness, domestic resource mobilization and new areas of support. However, international community support should not be incoherent with national policy objectives and priorities. And international objectives should be translated and aligned with national policies in a manner that facilitates achievements of both national and global priorities.

Among the measures suggested are scaling up interventions; targeting, promoting development effectiveness. Further, implementing the commitments made with respect to aid effectiveness (Rome, Paris, Accra and Busan Partnership Agreements), supporting new areas: R&D capacity, IT, physical capital, basic economic infrastructure, private sector development. Other measures include supporting measures that increase domestic resource mobilization and promoting South-South and triangular development cooperation.

Unfinished agenda on international cooperation (MDG 8 – Develop global partnership for development): This goal is critical to the delivery of the other seven goals. Unfortunately less tangible results have been experienced. Tracking of progress has equally been difficult.

(a) Findings

The critical areas that have experienced non delivery relate to the trade, external debt of developing countries, and cooperation for creation of decent and productive work for youth. With respect to external debt the concern was that sustainability was becoming elusive, while

for countries which had achieved sustainability, reversals are experienced (becoming more indebted than during pre-debt relief period).

(b) Priority Areas, Rationale and Required Actions

The areas of priority that were pointed out are trading system, debt overhang, youth unemployment.

The following measures were proposed: ensuring that developing countries benefit from expanding world trade through reforming the trading system so that LDCs have a voice; reforming the financial system. Further, scaling up debt relief beyond HIPC relief to total debt cancellation was seen as the most effective way for LDC reaching external debt sustainability. With respect to youth employment, the measures proposed included re-examination of FDIs in order to ensure that they bring technologies that promote youth employment (skills development, simple to adapt) allow useful information and communication to reach the youth wherever they are in the country.

International Peace and Security: The world has witnessed increasing escalation of conflicts and instabilities in a number of countries, with Sub-Saharan Africa experiencing the most. Apart from disrupting the political, social and economic fabric in the countries where these happen, spill-over effects to neighbouring countries are equally disrupted especially in cross border areas. Affected neighbouring countries lack the resources to mitigate the adverse impacts caused by these conflicts hence the international community has to come in.

(a) Findings

In the consultations, the negative impacts of conflicts in neighbouring countries were underlined. They include disruption of cross-border trade and movements, incursion of refugees with other consequences such as environmental degradation, banditry and other vices.

(c) Priority Areas, Rationale and Required Activities

The identified areas of priority included conflict resolution, improving governance and promoting inclusive socio-economic development

The international community is called to implement actions related to promoting measures that prevent conflicts; resolving conflicts so that they don't escalate into armed conflicts and assisting neighbouring countries so affected to mitigate the impact such as support to cope with inflow of refugees.

3.11 Volunteer Action and Civic Participation

(a) Introduction

In the context of Tanzania, volunteerism was collectively defined to mean those voluntary actions towards civic engagement, work that is carried out freely and without coercion and financial gain is not the main motivating principle. Volunteering actions and a strong people

centred approach are essential to the development of any new sustainable development framework and the achievement of social, economic and environmental transformations. Work is for the service of the community. It was noted that volunteerism is important for the engagement of people in tackling challenges, it empowers communities, has benefits for both society and the individual volunteer. The universal notion that embraces free will, solidarity, dignity and trust was re-affirmed through plenary discussion and localised through various inspiring examples of volunteerism in Tanzania.

(b) Findings

(i) Bottom up approach

Volunteerism believes that people and communities should be the key drivers at the start, the end and throughout any effort to transform society, build resilience, mitigate conflict and achieve sustainable development. It is about collaborative democracy that engages communities and brings together governments and people from all sectors who voluntarily respond to positive visions of inclusion, poverty reduction, gender equality, environment sustainability, peace and security, well-being and accountability.

(ii) Empowerment of target communities

The emphasis is on what women and men, girls and boys can do rather than what they cannot do, thus empowering people to participate in their development and that of their community and they can own and direct the results of any efforts/projects. In this way, volunteerism fosters ownership and broad-based, sustainable development that contributes to the achievement of several goals at the same time. These key cross-cutting and participatory features of volunteerism are often not measured by the current development frameworks although they are crucial to the achievement of sustainable development.

(c) Priority Areas, Rationale and required Actions

It was noted that recurring volunteer actions and civic participation challenges are always related to volunteer motivation and perception about volunteerism. In order to ensure that volunteer actions are recognized as important component of any strategy aimed at poverty reduction, sustainable development, overcoming social exclusion and discrimination, the following issues that are related to addressing the challenges facing volunteerism; promotion and fostering of volunteerism including civic participation and engagement; good governance, including accountability, rules and regulations are recommended for action:

(i) Create an enabling environment for volunteering and civic engagement by fostering policies, incorporating volunteerism into laws, regulations, school curriculum and syllabuses

- Revive the National Youth Service;
- Integration of volunteerism concepts in education system for increased scope, depth, visibility and impact;
- Mainstream volunteerism in government, development and humanitarian work;

- Recruit graduates for the promotion of volunteerism, and encourage unemployed graduates to participate in volunteerism;
 - Strengthen coordination mechanisms for voluntary work (amongst VIO's and lead departments);
- (ii) **Create an enabling environment for volunteering by promoting the sharing of good practices to scale up opportunities for people to volunteer, build new capacity for well-managed programmes, and identify community needs, assets and knowledge for transformational change**
- Establish long term lobbying and advocacy campaigns;
 - Promote volunteers as beneficiaries (e. g. developing skills set and getting relevant work experience);
 - Create opportunities for showcasing best practices and human impact stories of volunteerism;
 - Establish national award/reward system to recognise volunteerism and create positive perceptions;
 - Enhance private sector support for voluntary action through collaborative corporate community partnerships (including employee volunteering) that recognize the interdependence between business and societies and encourage the unique value that companies can add to sustainable development;
- (iii) **Strengthen the effectiveness of international volunteering in all its forms through a commitment to mutual learning, reciprocity, collaboration and constant reflection**
- Enhance and promote platforms for individuals to discuss experiences of, and opportunities for volunteerism, including exchanges between developed and developing countries (e.g. volunteer youth camps, volunteer exchange programmes, etc)
- (iv) **Develop accountability mechanisms for sustainable volunteerism including pursuing actions on measurement instruments.**
- Promote peer review and self-regulatory mechanisms for individuals and VIOs to enhance accountability and transparency;
 - Establish ways of measuring contributions of volunteerism - pursue actions to build up a knowledge base about voluntary work and to establish the economic value of volunteering.

4.0 CONCLUSION

As party to the UN Millennium Summit held in September 2000, Tanzania has been very keen in implementing the Millennium Development Goals, building on national efforts since independence that aimed at eradicating three identified ills namely poverty, ignorance and diseases. The current set of MDGs ends in 2015, Tanzania joins other nations of the world in articulating a future development agenda. Nationally, a number of other developments will need a new set of interventions – general elections, end year of the second generation Poverty Reduction Strategies as well as development plan. In both endeavours, key lessons learned during implementation of both the MDGs and national programmes will, of necessity inform articulation of the future development agenda – good experiences for embracing and challenges for addressing.

In articulating both the future global and national agenda an unprecedented consultative process was set in motion, including a constitutional review process. Seven consultation platforms were formed, namely, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Local Government Authority (LGAs), Vulnerable Group (the elderly, women, children, young women and youth), Private Sector, Officials from the two Central Governments, representatives from Higher Education and Research Institutions, and Zanzibar. In addition to workshops, different channels were also employed for collecting views.

The consultations led to prioritization of issues in the following sequence: Sustainable and Shared Growth; Science, Technology, Innovation (STIs) and Research and Development (R&D); Capacity Development; Income, Food Poverty and Malnutrition; Quality of Education; Access and Quality of Health Care Services and Non-Communicable Diseases; Management of Natural Resources; Climate change and Adaptation; Energy; Good Governance; Inequality and Social Protection and Global Issues. In all these areas, concerns around gender inequality and human rights should be addressed.

Though the details can be found in the respective sections, there are common issues that cut across all clusters. In a nutshell, Tanzanians articulated new aspirations in all areas, calling for a “business unusual” future development agenda and a better future for all in all these aspects.

The report provides important lessons for informing both the global agenda and future national development agenda in terms of both process and content. The process of consultations was designed in such a way as to ensure inclusiveness of the various socio-economic groups, paying particular attention to capturing voices of marginalized groups and those left out in previous processes, while embracing a bottom-up approach.

Implementation of the current set of MDGs has provided both opportunities and challenges. The main challenges related to inclusiveness in growth, quality and equity. These are the

issues that Tanzania has prioritized in the post 2015 development agenda both globally and nationally.

Tanzania has implemented a number of reforms in all aspects, political, social and economic. These reforms provide a favourable environment for implementing post 2015 development agenda nationally. While further actions are being implemented for increased mobilization of domestic resources and ensure that these implement national plans and programmes, international support will still be needed in the identified critical areas, at least in the foreseeable future.